





Geologic Disposal Safety Assessment (GDSA): How GDSA Benefits from International Collaborations

U.S. Nuclear Waste Technical Review Board Workshop Burlingame, CA April 24-25, 2019 Emily Stein Acting Manager Applied Systems Analysis and Research Sandia National Laboratories Albuquerque, NM



Sand a Natona Laboratores sa mu trinsson Laboratory managed and operated by Nationa Techno cgy & Eng neer ng So utons of Sand a, LLC, a whol y owned subs diary of Honeywel Internationa Inc., fort he U.S. Department of Energy s Natona Nuc ear Securt y Adm n strator under contract DE NA0003525.

#### SAND2019 4103 PE

# Geologic Disposal Safety Assessment (GDSA) Team

#### Thanks to GDSA team members

Jennifer Frederick, Glenn Hammond, Paul Mariner, Dave Sevougian, Emily Stein



And to the process modeling teams at



## Geologic Disposal Safety Assessment Work Scope



# How GDSA Benefits from International Collaboration

- International datasets and concepts
  - Technical bases (Natural Barrier System (NBS), Disturbed Rock Zone (DRZ), Engineered Barrier System (EBS))
- Contributions to post-closure performance assessment (PA) models
  - Identify relevant Features, Events, and Processes (FEPs)
  - Process model development and validation
- Confidence enhancement
  - PA methodology in accordance with international standards of practice
  - Improve confidence in PA software through benchmarking, debugging, and demonstration on diverse problems
  - Expanded functionality through user contributions
  - State-of-the-art developments in methods and tools

# **GDSA Framework**

Comprehensive software toolkit for post-closure performance assessment



- PFLOTRAN development
  - Robust multiphase and high temperature capability
  - Coupled Sub-System Process Models
    - Engineered Barrier Processes X Jové Colón, Rutqvist, Zheng
    - Near Field Perturbations

🛠 Kuhlman & Stauffer, Rutqvist

- Flow and Radionuclide Transport A Boukhalfa, Viswanathan
- Quality Assurance
  - Software verification test suite
  - Regression and unit tests
  - Documentation
- International visibility and promotion lpha
  - Open source software development
  - PFLOTRAN short courses
  - Participation in international venues

# **Repository Systems Analysis**

Biosphere



E. Stein, Geologic Disposal Safety Assessment (NWTRB April 2019)

# **Repository Systems Analysis**

- Reference case concepts
  - Features/Events/Processes (FEPs)
  - Repository design/layout
  - Dual Purpose Canister disposal concepts
  - Technical bases for engineered and natural systems
- Total system simulations and probabilistic PA
- Near field simulations to facilitate process model coupling
- Relies on international datasets

energy.gov/ne

# **Reference** Cases

#### 1. Crystalline



Surface portion of final repository 600 m

Underground portion of

2. Shale



3. Salt 3200 3400 3600 3800



#### E. Stein, Geologic Disposal Safety Assessment (NWTRB April 2019)

# Uncertainty Quantification and Sensitivity Analysis (UQ/SA)

- Implementation and application of uncertainty and sensitivity analysis methods
  - Effective methods for computationally expensive problems
  - Which methods return the most information on which problems?
- Feed back to research and development (R&D)
  - Which uncertain inputs contribute the most to uncertainty in the output?
  - Which uncertain inputs have little to no influence on output uncertainty?
- International collaboration
  - Exchange knowledge
  - Compare software and methods
  - Develop joint approach to sensitivity analysis

1. Introduction, Purpose, and Context



#### 5. Synthesis & Conclusions

- a.Key findings and statement(s) of confidence
- b.Discussion/disposition of remaining uncertainties
  - c. Path forward



#### **3.3.1 Waste & Engineered** Barriers Technical Basis

- a. Inventory characterization
- b. Waste form/waste package technical basis
- c. Buffer/backfill technical basis
- d. Shafts/seals technical basis
- e. UQ (aleatory, epistemic)

#### **3.3.2 Geosphere/ Natural** Barriers Technical Basis

- a. Site characterization
- b. Host rock/DRZ technical basis
- c. Aquifer/other geologic units technical basis
- d. UQ (aleatory, epistemic)

#### International datasets contribute to GDSA generic reference cases.

# Crystalline Reference Case – Natural Barrier System Technical Basis

Feature, Process	International Influences	URL / Site	References
Reference case site concept	Sweden	Forsmark	SKB 2007; 2008 Mariner et al. 2016
Fracture distribution	Sweden	Forsmark	Follin et al. 2014; Joyce et al. 2014; Wang et al. 2014; Mariner et al. 2016
Crystalline matrix permeability and porosity	Switzerland, Canada, Korea	<ul> <li>Grimsel,</li> <li>Lac du Bonnet,</li> <li>KURT</li> </ul>	Schild et al. 2001; Martino & Chandler 2004; Cho et al. 2013; Mariner et al. 2016
Effective diffusion coefficient	Switzerland	+ Grimsel	Soler et al. 2015; Mariner et al. 2016
DRZ permeability and extent	Canada, Korea	Lac du Bonnet, KURT	Martino & Chandler 2004; Cho et al. 2013; Mariner et al. 2016
Geochemical Environment	Sweden, Finland, Canada	Forsmark, Olkiluoto, Canadian Shield	SKB 2006; Posiva 2010; Mariner et al. 2011

# Crystalline Reference Case – Engineered Barrier System Technical Basis

Feature, Process	International Influences	References
Spent Nuclear Fuel Dissolution	Sweden	SKB 2006; Sassani et al. 2016
Bentonite Buffer Concepts	Korea, etc.	Choi and Choi 2008; Wang et al. 2014; Mariner et al. 2016
Bentonite Thermal Conductivity	Germany, China	Jobmann & Buntebarth 2009; Wang et al. 2015; Mariner et al. 2016
Bentonite Porosity and Permeability	France	Liu et al. 2016; Mariner et al. 2016
Bentonite Adsorption Distribution Coefficients (K <sub>d</sub> s)	Sweden	SKB 2004; Mariner et al. 2011

#### 4.2 Post-closure Safety Assessment

- a. FEPs analysis/screening
- b. Scenario construction/screening
- c. PA model/software validation
- d. Barrier/safety function analyses and subsystem analyses
- e. PA and Process Model Analyses/Results
- f. Uncertainty characterization and analysis
- g. Sensitivity analyses

International collaboration contributes directly to GDSA models and concepts.

International collaboration increases confidence in GDSA tools and methods.

# International URL Portfolio in a Nutshell



#### International URL Collaboration:

 Colloid Formation and Migration (CFM) – colloidal transport experiments at Grimsel Test Site and related laboratory experiments

#### How GDSA benefits:

- Identify kinetic and equilibrium regimes that result in significant colloid-facilitated transport over long time and distance scales
- Integration of generalized colloidal transport model

#### Key R&D Issue:

Flow and Radionuclide Transport



Grimsel



# Crystalline Reference Case – BRIE, LTDE



#### International URL Collaborations

- Bentonite Rock Interaction
   Experiment (BRIE) at the
   Äspö Hard Rock Laboratory
- Long Term Diffusion Experiment
   (LTDE) at Grimsel Test Site

#### How GDSA benefits:

- Conceptual models for bentonite saturation in fractured rock and diffusive transport in the DRZ
- Models and methods for simulation of flow and transport in fractured rock

#### Key R&D Issues:

Flow and Radionuclide Transport

#### **Engineered Barrier Integrity**





# Clay/Shale Reference Case – Mont Terri and Bure heater tests

#### **International URL Collaborations**

- Half-scale and full-scale heater emplacement tests at Mont Terri (Opalinus Clay)
- Heater tests at Bure (Callovo-Oxfordian Argillite)

#### How GDSA benefits:

- Conceptual model for mutual evolution of DRZ and buffer
- Integrate emulator(s) for Thermal Hydrological Mechanical (THM) evolution of buffer and DRZ in clay/shale repository





**Near Field Perturbation** 

Courtesy of J. Rutqvist



energy.gov/ne

# Salt Reference Case – BATS, Asse Mine Heater Test

#### **International URL Collaborations**

- Brine Availability Test in Salt (BATS) - heater test in the Waste Isolation Pilot Plant
- Asse Mine heater test salt creep and consolidation to validate THM constitutive laws

#### How GDSA benefits:

- Conceptual models for salt creep, evolution of porosity and permeability, gas and brine migration with heat
- Integrate emulator(s) for THMC evolution of backfill and DRZ



#### Key R&D Issues:

**Near Field Perturbation** 



Courtesy of Kris Kuhlman



energy.gov/ne

# Engineered Barrier System – FEBEX-DP and HotBENT

#### **International URL Collaborations**

Full-Scale Engineered Barrier
 Experiment-Dismantling
 Project and HotBENT – heater
 tests in bentonite at Grimsel
 Test Site

#### How GDSA benefits:

- Identify processes affecting evolution of engineered barrier properties
- Establish thermal limits for buffer integrity
- Integrate emulator(s) for THMC evolution of the buffer

#### Key R&D Issue:

**Engineered Barrier Integrity** 



Courtesy of Carlos Jové Colón



# Engineered Barrier System – DECOVALEX gas migration

# ÷

#### International URL Collaborations

- Gas injection experiment in low-permeability porous media (bentonite, shale)
- Planned field scale study at Mont Terri (DECOVALEX 2023)

#### How GDSA benefits:

- Conceptual model(s) for gas migration in bentonite and its effect on bentonite permeability
- Permeability (upscaled) as a function of gas pressure

#### Key R&D Issue:





#### **4.3 Confidence Enhancement**

- a. R&D prioritization
- b. Natural/anthropogenic analogues
- c. URL & large-scale demonstrations
- d. Monitoring and performance confirmation
- e. International collaboration & peer review
- f. Verification, validation, transparency
- g. Qualitative and robustness arguments

#### International collaboration increases confidence in GDSA tools and methods.

# **GDSA International Outreach and Collaborations**

- U.S./Germany Salt Collaboration
  - Development of comprehensive FEPs database
  - PA software benchmark comparison
- International Uncertainty Quantification and Sensitivity Analysis Collaboration
  - Contribute expertise to international discussion
  - Develop joint approach to sensitivity analysis
- DECOVALEX 2023 PA Proposal
- PFLOTRAN support for repository PA programs (ongoing w/ Taiwan, Australia)
  - Testing and demonstration on diverse problems
- Open source development
  - Transparency
    - Expanded functionality

# How GDSA Benefits from International Collaboration

- International datasets and concepts
  - Technical bases (Natural Barrier System (NBS), Disturbed Rock Zone (DRZ), Engineered Barrier System (EBS))
- Contributions to post-closure performance assessment (PA) models
  - Identify relevant Features, Events, and Processes (FEPs)
  - Process model development and validation
- Confidence enhancement
  - PA methodology in accordance with international standards of practice
  - Improve confidence in PA software through benchmarking, debugging, and demonstration on diverse problems
  - Expanded functionality through user contributions
  - State-of-the-art developments in methods and tools

## **Questions?**

# Clean. Reliable. Nuclear.

28

### References

- ANDRA (2005). Dossier 2005 Argile: Phenomological evolution of a geological repository. Agence Nationale pour la Gestion des Dechets Radioactifs. Paris, France: 527.
- Cho, W. J., J. S. Kim, C. Lee and H. J. Choi (2013). "Gas permeability in the excavation damaged zone at KURT," *Engineering Geology*, **164**:222-229.
- Choi, H. J. and J. Choi (2008). "Double-layered buffer to enhance the thermal performance in a high-level radioactive waste disposal system," *Nuclear Engineering and Design*, 238(10):2815-2820.
- Clayton, D., G. Freeze, T. Hadgu, E. Hardin, L. Lee, J. Prouty, R. Rogers, W. M. Nutt, J. Birkholzer, H. H. Liu, L. Zheng and S. Chu (2011). Generic Disposal System Modeling Fiscal Year 2011 Progress Report. SAND 2011-5828P, FCRD-USED-2011-000184. Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, New Mexico.
- Hardin, E. L. and E. Kalinina 2016. Cost Estimation Inputs for Spent Nuclear Fuel Geologic Disposal Concepts (Revision 1). SAND2016-0235. Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, NM.
- Jobmann, M. and G. Buntebarth (2009). "Influence of graphite and quartz addition on the thermo-physical properties of bentonite for sealing heat-generating radioactive waste," *Applied Clay Science*, **44**(3-4):206-210.
- Jové Colón, C. F., P. F. Weck, D. C. Sassani, L. Zheng, J. Rutqvist, C. I. Steefel, K. Kim, S. Nakagawa, J. Houseworth, J. Birkholzer, F. A. Caporuscio, M. Cheshire, M. S. Rearick, M. K. McCarney, M. Zavarin, A. Benedicto-Cordoba, A. B. Kersting, M. Sutton, J. L. Jerden, K. E. Frey, J. M. Copple and W. L. Ebert (2014). Evaluation of Used Fuel Disposition in Clay-Bearing Rock. FCRD-UFD- 2014-000056 , SAND2014-18303 R. Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, New Mexico.
- Liu, J. F., Y. Song, F. Skoczylas and J. Liu (2016). "Gas migration through water-saturated bentonite-sand mixtures, COx argillite, and their interfaces," *Canadian Geotechnical Journal*, 53(1):60-71.
- Mariner, P. E., J. H. Lee, E. L. Hardin, F. D. Hansen, G. A. Freeze, A. S. Lord, B. Goldstein, and R. H. Price 2011. Granite Disposal of U.S. High-Level Radioactive Waste. SAND2011-6203. Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, NM.
- Mariner, P. E., W. P. Gardner, G. E. Hammond, S. D. Sevougian, and E. R. Stein 2015. Application of Generic Disposal System Models. FCRD-UFD-2015-000126 / SAND2015-10037R. Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, NM.
- Mariner, P. E., E. R. Stein, J. M. Frederick, S. D. Sevougian, and G. E. Hammond 2017. Advances in Geologic Disposal System Modeling and Shale Reference Cases. SFWD-SFWST-2017-000044 / SAND2017-10304R. Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, NM.
- Mariner, P. E., E. R. Stein, J. M. Frederick, S. D. Sevougian, G. E. Hammond, and D. G. Fascitelli 2016. Advances in Geologic Disposal System Modeling and Application to Crystalline Rock. FCRD-UFD-2016-000440 / SAND2016-9610R. Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, NM.
- Mariner, P. E., E. R. Stein, S. D. Sevougian, L. J. Cunningham, J. M. Frederick, G. E. Hammond, T. S. Lowry, S. Jordan, and E. Basurto 2018. Advances in Geologic Disposal Safety Assessment and an Unsaturated Alluvium Reference Case. SFWD-SFWST-2018-000509; SAND2018-11858R. Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, NM.
- Martino, J. B. and N. A. Chandler (2004). "Excavation-induced damage studies at the Underground Research Laboratory," International Journal of Rock Mechanics and Mining Sciences, 41(8):1413-1426.
- Posiva 2010. Models and Data Report 2010. POSIVA 2010-01. Posiva Oy, Olkiluoto, Finland.
- Reimus, P. W., M. Zavarin, and Y. Wang 2016. Colloid-Facilitated Radionuclide Transport: Current State of Knowledge from a Nuclear Waste Repository Risk Assessment Perspective. FCRD-UFD-2016-000446; LA-UR-16-26638. Los Alamos National Laboratory, Los Alamos, NM.

- Rohlig, K., E. Plischke, D.-A. Becker, E. R. Stein, J. Govaerts, B. J. Debusschere, L. Koskinen, P. Kupiainen, C. D. Leigh, P. E. Mariner, O. Nummi, B. Pastina, S. D. Sevougian, S. Speissl, L. P. Swiler, E. Weetjens, and T. R. Zeitler. (2018). Sensitivity Analysis in Performance Assessment: Towards a Joint Approach. Paper presented at the IGSC Safety Case Symposium, Rotterdam, Netherlands.
- Rutqvist, J., K. Kim, H. Xu, Y. Guglielmi, and J. Birkholzer 2018. *Investigation of Coupled Processes in Argillite Rock: FY18 Progress*. LBNL-2001168. Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, Berkeley, CA.
- Sassani, D., J.-H. Jang, P. E. Mariner, L. Price, R. Rechard, M. Rigali, R. Rogers, E. R. Stein, W. Walkow, and P. Weck 2016. *The On-line Waste Library (OWL): Usage and Inventory Status Report*. FCRD-UFD\_2016-000080 / SAND2016-9485R. Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, NM.
- Schild, M., S. Siegesmund, A. Vollbrecht and M. Mazurek (2001). "Characterization of granite matrix porosity and pore-space geometry by in situ and laboratory methods," *Geophysical Journal International*, **146**(1):111-125.
- Sevougian, S. D., G. Freeze, M. Gross, K. Kuhlman, C. Leigh, J. Wolf, D. Buhmann, and J. Mönig 2016. "Joint US-German FEPs Catalog," presented at the 7th US/German Workshop on Salt Repository Research, Design, and Operation, Washington, DC, September 7-9, 2016, SAND2016-8441C, Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, NM
- SKB (Svensk K\u00e4mbr\u00e4nslehantering AB [Swedish Nuclear Fuel and Waste Management Company]) 2004. SR-Can Data and uncertainty assessment: Migration parameters for the bentonite buffer in the KBS-3 concept. TR-04-18. Svensk Karnbranslehantering AB, Stockholm, Sweden.
- SKB (Svensk Kämbränslehantering AB [Swedish Nuclear Fuel and Waste Management Company]) 2006. Data report for the safety assessment SR-Can. Svensk Kärnbränslehantering AB, Stockholm, Sweden.
- SKB (Svensk Kämbränslehantering AB [Swedish Nuclear Fuel and Waste Management Company]) 2007. Geology Forsmark. R-07-45. Svensk Karnbranslehantering AB, Stockholm, Sweden.
- SKB (Svensk Kämbränslehantering AB [Swedish Nuclear Fuel and Waste Management Company]) 2008. Bedrock hydrogeology Forsmark. R-08-45. Svensk Karnbranslehantering AB, Stockholm, Sweden.
- Soler, J. M., J. Landa, V. Havlova, Y. Tachi, T. Ebina, P. Sardini, M. Siitari-Kauppi, J. Eikenberg and A. J. Martin (2015). "Comparative modeling of an in situ diffusion experiment in granite at the Grimsel Test Site," *Journal of Contaminant Hydrology*, **179**:89-101.
- Turrero, M., A. Fernández, J. Peña, M. Sánchez, P. Wersin, P. Bossart, M. Sánchez, A. Melón, A. Garralón and A. Yllera (2006). "Pore water chemistry of a Paleogene continental mudrock in Spain and a Jurassic marine mudrock in Switzerland: Sampling methods and geochemical interpretation," *Journal* of Iberian Geology, **32**(2):233-258.
- Wang, Y., E. Matteo, J. Rutqvist, J. Davis, L. Zheng, J. Houseworth, J. Birkholzer, T. Dittrich, C. W. Gable, S. Karra, N. Makedonska, S. Chu, D. Harp, S. L. Painter, P. Reimus, F. V. Perry, P. Zhao, J. B. Begg, M. Zavarin, S. J. Tumey, Z. R. Dai, A. B. Kersting, J. Jerden, K. E. Frey, J. M. Copple and W. Ebert (2014). Used Fuel Disposal in Crystalline Rocks: Status and FY14 Progress. FCRD-UFD-2014-000060, SAND2014-17992 R. Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, New Mexico.
- Wang, M., Y. F. Chen, S. Zhou, R. Hu, and C. B. Zhou 2015. "A homogenization-based model for the effective thermal conductivity of bentonite-sand-based buffer material". *International Communications in Heat and Mass Transfer, 68,* 43-49.
- Zheng, L., J. Rutqvist, H. Xu, and J. T. Birkholzer 2017. "Coupled THMC models for bentonite in an argillite repository for nuclear waste: Illitization and its effect on swelling stress under high temperature". *Engineering Geology*, 230, 118-129.